STATE OF TEXAS COUNTY OF HIDALGO CITY OF MCALLEN

The Historic Preservation Council convened in a meeting on Wednesday, August 7, 2024 at 9:02 a.m.at the McAllen Development Center – 311 N. 15th Street – Executive Conference Rm

Present: Danny Boultinghouse Vice-Chairperson

Carolina Civarolo Member Melissa S. Knerr Member Marc Millis Member

Absent: Dr. Jaclyn Miller Chairperson

Staff Present: Evaristo Garcia Assistant City Attorney III

Edgar Garcia Planning Director

Samantha Trevino Planner I

Magda Ramirez Administrative Assistant

CALL TO ORDER - Dr. Jaclyn Miller - Chairperson

1. Minutes

a) Approval or Disapproval of Minutes held on July 10, 2024

Mr. Marc Millis <u>moved</u> to approve the minutes. Ms. Carolina Civarolo <u>seconded</u> the motion. Motion approved with four board members present and voting.

2. Public Hearing:

a) Request of Mario Luis Guerra Jr. for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a proposed single family residence within the Las Palmas Historic District at Lot 11, Block 12, North McAllen Subdivision, Hidalgo County, Texas; 604 North 15th Street. (CLM2024-0003)

Ms. Trevino stated a Certificate of Appropriateness was required for all proposed exterior alterations, new construction, and demolition within a local historic district. The goal of a Certificate of Appropriateness is to preserve historic, architectural, and cultural heritage by protecting character-defining features of the Las Palmas Historic District.

The property was located on the east side of N. 15th Street, north of Fir Avenue. The site plan indicates that the property has 50 feet of frontage along N. 15th Street and a depth of 140 feet for a lot size of 7,000 square feet. The lot have never been developed.

The applicant is proposing to construct a new residence with a storage room in the rear attached to the home in the Modern Spanish Mediterranean style.

The design review process for the Certification of Appropriateness is critical within a designated historic district to ensure that the unique and defining characteristics of the area are maintained according to the design standards of the Las Palmas Historic District.

Historic Preservation Council Meeting August 7, 2024 Page 2

- 1. SITING: Any new development should follow the zoning ordinance and maintain the setback of existing adjacent buildings. When setbacks on either front or backside of new construction vary, an average distance should be taken and used as a guideline for siting the new residence.
 - Setbacks To ensure consistency in the historic district, new construction should follow existing ordinance requirements.

For the proposed new house, the applicant proposes a front setback of 40 feet, a rear setback of 10 feet, and a north side setback of 5 feet and south side setback of 7 feet. The plans submitted seem to comply with the design standards of a front yard setback of 40 feet or in line with existing for Block 12, North McAllen Subdivision and will be reviewed during the building permit process.

- 2. SCALE OF BUILT ENVIRONMENT: Existing homes within the historic district range from one to two stories in height. Roof forms and building footprints also vary but most homes comprise only a small portion of their lot and do not exceed an average of more than 20 percent of the overall lot size.
 - Consistency of Style New construction should not try to mimic the architectural styles
 of the past but should look to them for guidance on fenestration patterns, façade
 organization, level and extent of detailing, massing, roof forms and height, and materials
 used. New construction should reflect modern design but be sensitive to the historical
 architectural styles of the past that are represented within the Las Palmas Historic District.

The applicant submitted plans for a two-story single family in the Modern Spanish Mediterranean style of architecture (see attached plans). The plans submitted comply with the consistency of style design standards.

 Scale – New construction should maintain a scale that mirrors and respects the scale of adjacent properties. Existing residences within the Las Palmas neighborhood are sited on approximately 15 to 20 percent of the overall lot.

The applicant proposes a two- story single-family residence with a building footprint that is 4183 square feet or 59% of the total lot area.

The average building footprint of the Las Palmas Historic District is currently 24%. The plans submitted do not comply with the design standards of scale with a building footprint of 59% that is greater than the 20% as recommended in the standards but may be acceptable, as the Board has approved a greater percentage than the 20% maximum.

 Materials – Primary exterior materials used within the historic district include stucco and brick or stone masonry. Wood trim exists on a few examples. Primary roof materials include clay tile, composition shingle, and wood shingles. New construction should maintain the characteristics of existing exterior materials. Other exterior wall materials such as simulated stone, hardi-board or vinyl siding would detract from the cohesiveness of the neighborhood and should be avoided.

The applicant was proposing a combination of brick, stucco and wood siding for the exterior of

Historic Preservation Council Meeting August 7, 2024 Page 3

the front façade. The stucco color is to be Snowball 10400L (75) and all facia and soffit will be Sherwin Williams Snowfall white 2144-70. For the roof, the applicant proposes black clay tile.

- 3. SITE FEATURES: One of the most recognizable features of the Las Palmas Historic District is the palm-lined center median that extends the length of the district. Palm trees also line the street along each side of North 15th Street along the front yard of most lots. Well-manicured lawns with native plantings are typical of residences within the neighborhood.
 - Fencing Historically, fence enclosures at the perimeter of the Las Palmas Historic District, if they existed, were isolated to the rear yard. Low landscaping walls of stone or brick masonry construction can be seen along front patios or along the side property line in the district.

The applicant was not proposing at fence at this time, but would like to add one in the future. A COA will be required at the time of construction.

The design of the home is acceptable, but size may overwhelm the character of existing homes and detract from existing character. Staff is recommending for the home to be moved back to be in line with other homes in the area and for the footprint to be decreased.

Should the request be approved, it will be subject to conditions noted on the approved permit.

Staff recommended disapproval of the new home as currently proposed.

Mr. Todd Henningsen, 6730 Mile 7 Road, Mission, Texas. The contractor stated the house was designed to meet the style of the neighboring houses and the same of amount of lot taken.

Vice-Chairperson Boultinghouse asked if there was anyone present in opposition of the proposal request.

Ms. Trevino stated there were no phone calls, letters or emails in opposition to the request.

Board member Civarolo asked staff if the four or five new houses along the block were on that 20-foot setback or further back. Staff stated they were on the 40 foot or in line with existing. Most of the houses on this side of 15th Street their property line started right at the street.

Board member Millis asked staff what was the percentages to the right, to the left, and to the Rhodes' house. Staff stated the Rhodes' house was at 36 percent on the initial proposal and the Board did approve it.

Chairperson Boultinghouse asked staff what was a Golf Support Easement. Staff stated it was something that was to be corrected on the site plan but it was a standard setback for staff. It was a 10-foot rear yard setback for the applicant to be in compliance.

Chairperson Boultinghouse asked if there was any reason the house could be moved back a little more. Mr. Henningsen, the contractor stated staff informed them they had to move it away from the back. Staff stated as long as they comply. The way the house was designed as long as they respect the front and rear yard setback staff was fine with it. Mr. Henningsen stated they made the house smaller in order to comply.

Historic Preservation Council Meeting August 7, 2024 Page 4

Following discussion, Mr. Marc Millis <u>moved</u> to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition for the house to be moved back to be in line with the adjacent properties . Mr. Daniel Padilla <u>seconded</u> the motion. The board voted to approve the item with four board members present and voting.

3. Adjournment

motion, which passed unanimous	o adjourn the meeting. Ms. Carolina Civarolo <u>seconded</u> the sly with four members present and voting. The meeting was
adjourned at 9:17 a.m.	
	Dr. Jaclyn Miller- Chairperson
ATTEST	
Magda Ramirez	